IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS EASTERN DIVISION

Lead Case: 1:18-cv-07686

Honorable Thomas M. Durkin

IN RE: LION AIR FLIGHT JT 610 CRASH

Consolidated With:

1:18-cv-08006	1:19-cv-01588
1:19-cv-00622	1:19-cv-01598
1:19-cv-00797	1:19-cv-01600
1:19-cv-00802	1:19-cv-01601
1:19-cv-01550	1:19-cv-01623
1:19-cv-01552	1:19-cv-01624
1:19-cv-01553	1:19-cv-01625
1:19-cv-01554	1:19-cv-01626
1:19-cv-01695	1:19-cv-01697
1:19-cv-01698	1:19-cv-01701
1:19-cv-01703	1:19-cv-01712
1:19-cv-01714	1:19-cv-01715
1:19-cv-01924	1:19-cv-01932
1:19-cv-01935	1:19-cv-01951
1:19-cv-01992	1:19-cv-02312
1:19-cv-02315	1:19-cv-02074
1:19-cv-02240	1:19-cv-02241
1:19-cv-02774	1:19-cv-02212
1:19-cv-02213	1:19-cv-02214
1:19-cv-02398	1:19-cv-02400
1:19-cv-02919	1:19-cv-02025
1:19-cv-02979	1:19-cv-02980
1:19-cv-02982	1:19-cv-02084
1:19-cv-02987	

DEFENDANT THE BOEING COMPANY'S MOTION FOR REASSIGNMENT OF RELATED CASES

Defendant The Boeing Company ("Boeing"), through its undersigned counsel, respectfully moves this Court to enter an order finding the above-captioned case is related to the two cases attached as Exhibits A and B, and reassigning to this Court the two cases attached as

Exhibits A through B, pursuant to Local Rule 40.4. In support of this Motion, Boeing states as follows:

- 1. On October 29, 2018, a Boeing 737-8 aircraft (the "Subject Aircraft"), operated by Lion Air as Lion Air Flight JT 610 ("Lion Air JT 610"), departed from Jakarta, Indonesia en route to Pangkal Pinang, Indonesia. Shortly after takeoff, Lion Air JT 610 crashed into the Java Sea off the coast of Indonesia. All 189 passengers and crew members died in the accident.
- 2. On November 19, 2018, plaintiffs filed this lawsuit (the "Saputra" action) against Boeing on behalf of three Lion Air JT 610 passengers. The Saputra plaintiffs claim the crash occurred because of alleged defects on the Subject Aircraft. See Dkt. 1, Complaint. The Saputra complaint alleges wrongful death and survival claims and asserts causes of action sounding in strict products liability and negligence. See id.
- 3. The Court consolidated *Saputra* and all related Lion Air JT 610 actions pending before it and captioned the consolidated case "In re Lion Air Flight JT 610 Crash." *See* Dkt. 37, 73, 138. Forty-eight related Lion Air JT 610 lawsuits are currently pending before this Court.
- 4. Two other lawsuits have been filed in this District against Boeing on behalf of Lion Air JT 610 passengers:
 - Oktaviani v. The Boeing Company, No. 19-cv-02764 (assigned to Hon. Matthew F. Kennelly)
 - Soegiyono v. The Boeing Company, No. 19-cv-03415 (assigned to Hon. Sharon Johnson Coleman)

(the "Subject Actions"). The complaints are attached as Exhibits A and B.

5. Plaintiffs in the Subject Actions also claim the accident occurred because of alleged defects on the Subject Aircraft. *See* Exs. A-B. Plaintiffs also allege wrongful death and survival claims, and assert causes of action sounding in strict products liability and negligence. *Id*.

- 6. Judges in this District have observed that the random case assignment system can often lead to "situations in which two or more cases that are closely related will be pending before different judges." *Garner v. Country Club Hills*, No. 11 C 5164, 2012 WL 1900020, at *1 (N.D. Ill. May 23, 2012). Accordingly, Local Rule 40.4(b) provides for assignment of "related" actions to a single judge where "(1) both cases are pending in this Court; (2) the handling of both cases by the same judge is likely to result in a substantial saving of judicial time and effort; (3) the earlier case has not progressed to the point where designating a later filed case as related would be likely to delay the proceedings in the earlier case substantially; and (4) the cases are susceptible of disposition in a single proceeding." Actions are related if the cases involve some of the same issues of fact or law or the cases grow out of the same transaction or occurrence. *See* L.R. 40.4(a)(2)-(3).
- 7. Courts routinely reassign related cases under this rule. *See e.g., Popovich v. McDonald's Corp.*, 189 F. Supp. 2d 772, 778 (N.D. Ill. 2002) (finding L.R. 40.4(b)(4) met where two civil cases "[arose], in significant part, from the same transactions and occurrences" and were "susceptible of resolution in a single proceeding," and "because of the overlap in issues, the handling of both cases by one judge [was] likely to result in a substantial savings of time and effort"); *Perry v. Chicago Housing Auth.*, No. 13-cv-5819, 2013 WL 5408860, at *2-3 (N.D. Ill. Sept. 26, 2013) (same). Indeed, more than 40 other Lion Air JT 610 cases already have been reassigned under this Rule to this Court.
- 8. Given the identity of the factual allegations at issue, the Subject Actions plainly involve "common question[s] of law or fact" with and are "related" to the consolidated case under Local Rule 40.4(a). The Subject Actions and the consolidated case involve wrongful death and survival claims brought on behalf of Lion Air JT 610 passengers or crew members against Boeing. Plaintiffs in the Subject Actions and the consolidated case assert causes of action involving strict products liability and negligence. The claims arise out of the same incident on October 29, 2018. The remaining conditions for reassignment under Local Rule 40.4(b) also are met. First, due to the random assignment system, the Subject Actions are now pending in this

District before two judges. Second, reassigning the Subject Actions to this Court will conserve judicial resources because the cases involve the same allegations and issues and, therefore, it will be far more efficient to have one judge preside over them. Third, reassignment would not cause delay as the cases are at their inception. Fourth, because the cases are almost identical and

involve the same core of law and facts, they are susceptible to disposition in a single proceeding.

WHEREFORE, for the reasons stated above, Boeing respectfully requests that this Court issue an order, in accordance with Local Rule 40.4, finding that the consolidated case is related to the Subject Actions, and reassigning the Subject Actions to this Court as part of the consolidated case "In re Lion Air Flight JT 610 Crash."

DATED: June 5, 2019 THE BOEING COMPANY

By: /s/ Bates McIntyre Larson
One of its Attorneys

Bates McIntyre Larson
BLarson@perkinscoie.com
Daniel T. Burley
DBurley@perkinscoie.com
Perkins Coie LLP
131 S. Dearborn, Suite 1700

Chicago, Illinois 60603-5559 Phone: (312) 324-8400

Fax: (312) 324-9400

Mack H. Shultz
MShultz@perkinscoie.com
Gretchen M. Paine
GPaine@perkinscoie.com
Perkins Coie LLP
1201 Third Avenue, Suite 4900
Seattle, Washington 98101-3099

Phone: (206) 359-8000 Fax: (206) 359-9000

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Bates McIntyre Larson, certify that on June 5, 2019, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will notify the following attorneys of record:

Floyd A. Wisner faw@wisner-law.com
Alexandra M. Wisner
Awisner@wisner-law.com
WISNER LAW FIRM, P.C.
514 W. State Street Suite 2000
Geneva, Illinois 60134
(630) 262-9434
Counsel for Plaintiffs
Case No. 18 cv 07686

Thomas A. Demetrio
Michael K. Demetrio
ccfiling@corboydemetrio.com
CORBOY & DEMETRIO, P.C.
33 N. Dearborn St., Suite 2100
Chicago, Illinois 60602
(312) 346-3191
Counsel for Plaintiffs
Case No. 19 cv 00622

Thomas P. Routh contact@nolan-law.com
NOLAN LAW GROUP
20 N. Clark Street 30th Floor
Chicago, Illinois 60602
(312) 630-4000
Counsel for Plaintiffs
Case No. 18 cv 08006
Case No. 19 cv 01712
Case No. 19 cv 01714
Case No. 19 cv 01715
Case No. 19 cv 02240
Case No. 19 cv 02241

Andrew T. Hays ahays@haysfirm.com Sarah Buck Sarah.buck@haysfirm.com Hays Firm LLC Austin Bartlett austin@bartlettchenlaw.com BartlettChen LLC 150 N. Michigan Ave., Ste. 2800 Chicago, Illinois 60601 (312) 624-7711

and

Manuel von Ribbeck mail@ribbecklaw.com Ribbeck Law Chartered 505 N. Lake Shore Dr. Suite 102 Chicago, Illinois 60611 (833) 883-4373 Counsel for Plaintiffs Case No. 19 cv 00802 Case No. 19 cv 01550 Case No. 19 cv 01552 Case No. 19 cv 01553 Case No. 19 cv 01554 Case No. 19 cv 01588 Case No. 19 cv 01598 Case No. 19 cv 01600 Case No. 19 cv 01601 Case No. 19 cv 01623 Case No. 19 cv 01624 Case No. 19 cv 01625 Case No. 19 cv 01626 Case No. 19 cv 01695 Case No. 19 cv 01697 Case No. 19 cv 01698 Case No. 19 cv 01701 Case No. 19 cv 01703 Case No. 19 cv 02919

55 W. Wacker Drive, 14th Fl. Chicago, IL 60602 (312) 626-2537

and

Steven C. Marks smarks@podhurst.com Kristina M. Infante kinfante@podhurst.com SunTrust International Center, Ste 2300 One S.E. Third Ave. Miami, Florida 33131 (305) 358-2800 Counsel for Plaintiffs Case No. 19 cv 01924 Case No. 19 cv 01932 Case No. 19 cv 01935 Case No. 19 cv 01951 Case No. 19 cv 01992 Case No. 19 cv 02212 Case No. 19 cv 02213 Case No. 19 cv 02214 Case No. 19 cv 02398 Case No. 19 cv 02400 Case No. 19 cv 02025

Jay Edelson
jedelson@edelson.com
Ari J. Scharg
ascharg@edelson.com
Benjamin H. Richman
brichman@edelson.com
EDELSON PC
350 N. LaSalle St., 14th Floor
Chicago, IL 60654
T: (312) 589-6370
F: (312) 589-6378

Rafey S. Balabanian rbalabanian@edelson.com 123 Townsend, Suite 100 San Francisco, CA 94107 T: (415) 212-9300 F: (415) 373-9435 Thomas G. Gardiner tgardiner@gkwwlaw.com
John R. Wrona
jwrona@gkwwlaw.com
Shannon V. Condon
scondon@gkwwlaw.com
GARDINER KOCH WEISBERG &
WRONA
53 W. Jackson Blvd. Ste. 950
Chicago, Illinois 60604
(312) 362-0000
Counsel for Plaintiffs
Case No. 19 cv 00797

Steven A. Hart shart@hmhlegal.com John S. Marrese jmarrese@hmelegal.com HART McLAUGHLIN & ELDRIDGE 22 W. Washington St. Suite 1600 Chicago, Illinois 60602 (312) 955-0545

and

Brian S. Kabateck bsk@kbklawyers.com Christopher B. Noyes cn@kbklawyers.com KABATECK LLP 633 W. 5th Street, Suite 3200 Los Angeles, CA 90071 (213) 217-5000

and

Sanjiv N. Singh ssingh@sahivnsingh.com SANJIV N. SINGH, APLC 1650 S. Amphlett Blvd. Suite 220 San Mateo, CA 94402 (650) 389-2255 Counsel for Plaintiffs Case No. 19 cv 02312 Case No 19 cv 02315 and

Thomas V. Girardi tgirardi@girardi@girardikeese.com Keith D. Griffin kgriffin@girardikeese.com GIRARDI | KEESE 1126 Wilshire Blvd.
Los Angeles, CA 90017 T: (213) 977-0211 F: (213) 481-1554 Counsel for Plaintiffs Case No. 19 cv 02979 Case No 19 cv 02980 Case No. 19 cv 02982 Case No 19 cv 02984 Case No. 19 cv 02987

Case No 19 cv 02074 Case No 19 cv 02764 Case No 19 cv 03415

Carmen D. Caruso
cdc@cdcaruso.com
Carmen D. Caruso Law Firm
77 W. Washington St., Ste. 1900
Chicago, IL 60602
T: (312) 626-1160

and

Charles Herrmann
charles@hlg.lawyer.com
Mark E. Lindquist
Anthony Marsh
Crystal Lloyd
crystal@hlg.lawyer.com
Herrmann Law Group
505 5th Ave. South Ste. 330
Seattle, WA 98104
T: (206) 625-9104
Counsel for Plaintiffs
Case No. 19 cv 02774

I certify under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

DATED this 5th day of June, 2019.

/s/ Bates M. Larson

PERKINS COIE LLP

131 South Dearborn Street, Suite No. 1700 Chicago, Illinois 60603-5559

Tel: (312) 324-8400 Fax: (312) 324-940003